Vision 2057: University Land Use Planning

Prepared for:
University of Saskatchewan

Prepared by:
Brook McIlroy Inc.
October 2009
Vision 2057:
University Land Use Planning

Prepared for:
University of Saskatchewan
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements

Executive Summary i

1. University Context 1
   1.1 University Lands 1
   1.2 The University in the City Context 3
   1.3 The University’s Lands Beyond the Core Campus & Saskatoon Urban Area 5

2. The University’s Land Use Process 7
   2.1 Introduction 7
   2.2 Vision 2057 Planning Process (2009) 7
   2.3 Land Use Task Force (Study 2008) 9
      2.3.1 Recommended Scenario Rationale 10
      2.3.2 The 50-Year Vision 13
      2.3.3 Financial Analysis 13
      2.3.4 Summary of Key Findings & Recommendations 14
   2.4 Core Area Master Plan (2003) 15
   2.5 Land Use & Urban Design Study (1999) 15

3. Proposed Land Use Designations 16
   3.1 Introduction 16
   3.2 The Land Use Designation Plan 17
      3.2.1 Description of Designations 17
      3.2.2 Core Campus Lands 18
      3.2.3 Endowment Lands 18
   3.3 The Land Use Designation Plan Rationale 19
   3.4 College of Agriculture & Bioresources Land Use Transition Impacts 21
Acknowledgements

Vision 2057 – University Land Use Planning Committee Members:

Co-chairs
- Karen Chad, Acting VP – Research
- Richard Florizone, VP – Finance and Resources

Committee Members
- Bryan Bilokreli, Integrated Planning & Assessment
- James Cook, Corporate Administration
- Randy Grauer, City of Saskatoon Planning Department
- Colin Hartl, Planner, Space Management & Planning
- Grant Isaac, Dean, Edwards School of Business
- Jay Kalra, Chair, Planning and Priorities Committee of Council
- Rose Olfert, Research, Scholarly & Artistic Committee of Council
- Carol Rodgers, Dean, College of Kinesiology
- Graham Scoles, Acting Dean, College of Agriculture & Bioresources
- Josie Steeves, President, University of Saskatchewan Students’ Union
- Peter Stoicheff, Vice-Dean, Humanities & Fine Arts
- Doug Tastad, President, Innovation Place
- Colin Tennent, Associate VP - Facilities Management Division
- Kevin Veitenheimer, Ministry of Advanced Education, Employment & Labour
- Janice Victor, President, Graduate Students’ Association
- Brenda Wallace, Meewasin Valley Authority
- Judy Yungwirth, Corporate Administration

This document was prepared by Brook McIlroy Inc. (BMI) for the University of Saskatchewan, with assistance from Marshall Macklin Monaghan (Transportation Engineering), Genivar (Municipal Services Engineering), and the Vision 2057 - University Land Use Planning Steering Committee.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Vision 2057 Objective

The objective of the “Vision 2057: University Land Use Planning” initiative, which commenced in December 2008, is to provide a land use planning framework that provides some certainty as to the eventual role various University-owned lands will play in the future. This Vision 2057 report recommends a designation system that identifies lands as either Core or Endowment Lands.

The University’s 1865 acre/755 hectare main campus urban lands are critical as resources for teaching and research but also have an increasingly significant economic value. The University has recognized the role of land as an important strategic resource in the search for diversified sources of revenue as reflected in the President’s Message “Renewing the Dream: University of Saskatchewan Strategic Directions 2002”, which identifies a strategic priority to “Enhance our revenue opportunities (through the)... creative use of endowment lands...”

Land is a critical resource to sustainable University success and growth. It facilitates:

- Teaching & Research Excellence
- Remaining Competitive: Recruitment & Retention
- Financial Sustainability
- Environmental Sustainability
- Improved Community Integration
- Enhanced Partnerships

Vision 2057 Builds Upon the Land Use Task Force

The Vision 2057 process builds upon the extensive research undertaken as part of the University’s Land Use Task Force in 2008 which identified a strategy that balances the need to maintain a significant land resource reserved for long-term University purposes, including on-campus agricultural research, while benefitting from potential revenues that could be realized through leasehold development estimated at between $300 - $900 million to fund a permanent preliminary university endowment.

Vision 2057 Process

The Vision 2057 process has been directed by a Steering Committee with representation from various University academic and administrative units as well as external members representing the City of Saskatoon, the Meewasin Valley Authority, the Province of Saskatchewan and Innovation Place.

The work of the Vision 2057 Steering Committee was assisted by consultants in the areas of land use planning (Brook McIlroy Inc.), transportation (Marshall Macklin Monaghan) and municipal services (Genivar).

A key focus of the Vision 2057 process was to engage key University and external stakeholders in a consultation process as a continuation of the in-depth University consultation process undertaken as part of the Land Use Task Force. The deliberations of the Steering Committee facilitated strategic input by key stakeholders represented in the composition of the Committee membership. Beyond the Committee process consultations focused on a review of the proposed land use strategy and identified implications and impacts of a transition in land uses. This consultation process included:
• College of Agriculture and Bioresources: On-going meetings were held throughout the Vision 2057 process with College representatives including a College-wide workshop. In-depth meetings were held to formulate and review a College Long-Term Land Strategy (March 31 & May 1, 2009).
• City of Saskatoon: University briefing session followed by a full-day University/City workshop to identify implications of development of University Endowment lands (May 7, 2009).
• Executive Committee of Saskatoon City Council: A Vision 2057 briefing presentation by the University (May 11, 2009)
• University/Community Open House - including invitation to crop and livestock industry organizations (May 26, 2009)
• Presentation to Research, Scholarly and Artistic Work Committee of Council (May 27, 2009)
• Presentation to Planning & Priorities (June 10, 2009)
• Presentation to Dean’s Council (June 16, 2009)
• Presentation to Senate Roundtable on Outreach & Engagement (June 17, 2009)
• Presentation to University Council (June 18, 2009)
• Presentation to Provost’s Committee on Integrated Planning (June 22, 2009)
• Presentation to President’s Executive Committee (June 22, 2009)

A summary of the main findings of Vision 2057 are contained on the following pages.
The University of Saskatchewan’s Current Land Resources (2009)

The University of Saskatchewan has land holdings of approximately 13,385 acres/5,417 hectares across the Province of Saskatchewan, including the main campus lands (see maps below).

These lands are comprised of:

a) Main Saskatoon campus urban lands of 1,865 acres/755 hectares.

b) Approximately 10 sections (6,400 acres/2,590 hectares) used for research purposes either directly by the University of Saskatchewan or by associated institutions.

c) Approximately 8 sections (5,120 acres/2,072 hectares) of farm land outside of Saskatoon that are leased to tenants to grow crops.

Approximately 4,600 acres/1,862 hectares of the lands itemized in b) and c) above are located within a 25-kilometre radius of the campus and a majority of these lands are within 10 kilometres. Therefore, almost half of the University’s total land holdings (6,465 acres/2,616 hectares) are within, or close to, Saskatoon. This represents a significant land resource and it will play a key role in the University’s future success.
Future Acquisitions

The University is actively pursuing the purchase of additional lands within the ‘near-city’ area that would increase agricultural research lands within a reasonable driving distance from campus to accommodate uses such as the Beef Research Unit which have been determined to be better suited to a non-urban area. The University has benefited from land donations in the past and it is anticipated that the University’s current land inventory of 13,385 acres/5,417 hectares will continue to expand both through strategic acquisitions and land donations.

As part of the Vision 2057 process, the College of Agriculture and Bioresources has prepared a “College of Agriculture and Bioresources Long-Term Land Use Strategy” (submitted under a separate cover) which identifies a potential need for 16 quarter sections of near-city land to accommodate future land needs for the College’s operations.

The University’s Main Campus Urban Lands

- Approximately 647 acres/262 hectares (Blocks A1, D, G, H, and L) or 35% of the University’s 1,865-acre main campus urban land holdings are presently ‘urban-developed’. The term urban-developed refers to those areas that are generally developed with buildings, parking facilities and related open spaces as distinct from those open space lands used primarily for agricultural purposes. These urban-developed areas include the Core Campus, the main campus farm, College Quarter (excluding Field Plots), Innovation Place and Preston Crossing.

- Within the urban-developed lands 488 acres/198 hectares (Blocks A1 and D) are dedicated primarily to University and related purposes and include the Core Campus, the main campus farm and College Quarter.
Approximately 1,068 acres/432 hectares (Blocks A2, B, C, E, F, I, J, K, and M) or 57% of the University’s main campus urban land holdings are open space lands predominately utilized by the College of Agriculture and Bioresources for agricultural teaching and research.

The remaining 150 acres/61 hectares or 9% of the main campus urban lands are comprised of two land parcels located north of Garvie Road and include leased/surrounding lands related to the Regional Psychiatric Centre (Block N) on the west side of Central Avenue and a site undergoing environmental remediation on the east side of Central (Block O).

### Land for Long-term University Growth

- Within the urban-developed area of the campus, approximately 5 million square feet/465,000 square metres of University building area has been built on 488 acres/198 hectares of land. The campus is presently a ‘low-density’ setting with significant areas of undeveloped land or land and facilities with the capacity to be intensified to accommodate future University growth.

- To quantify the low-density nature of the University of Saskatchewan’s developed campus and verify its capacity to accommodate significant future growth a comparison was conducted with other Western Canadian universities. Compared to the University of Saskatchewan’s FSI of 0.24 FSI:
  - University of Manitoba FSI = 0.26,
  - University of British Columbia FSI = 0.64, and
  - University of Alberta FSI = 1.03

- The 2003 Campus Plan identified the potential for long-term growth of another 3 million square feet/279,000 square metres of building area that could be comfortably accommodated within the developed campus lands area. Future University growth contained within the developed area (referred to as the Core Campus and College Quarter areas) as opposed to expansion beyond these areas is desirable as a means of maintaining reasonable walking distances between campus facilities.

- This 3 million square feet/279,000 square metre potential growth would represent a 60% increase in building area, an FSI of 0.38, and could theoretically translate to a potential student enrollment of 25,900 (compared to the 2008-09 regular session enrolment of 19,200).

- It is therefore unlikely that land beyond this 488 acre/198 hectare developed land area will be required for long-term expansion of University buildings and related facilities, however, the recommendations contained in this study also provide the potential for lands outside of the urban-developed area to be available for future University related facilities that may be unforeseen at this time.
Agricultural Research Lands

- Of the 1,068 acres/432 hectares of primarily open space area used for agriculture teaching and research about 37% (390 acres/158 hectares – Blocks A2, B, I and J, plus a small portion of Block M) of these lands are used primarily for plant and crop research including horticultural research. While generally under the stewardship of the Department of Plant Sciences a portion of these lands are less intensively used including a western segment of Block A2 (approximately 10 acres/4 hectares). In addition, approximately 20 acres/8 hectares of Block B is used by the University’s Facilities Management Division as a tree nursery. Discounting these areas, approximately 360 acres/146 hectares of land have a direct role in plant and crop teaching and research and benefit from their proximity to the Core Campus.

- The remaining 63% (678 acres/274 hectares - Blocks C, E, F, K and M) are primarily used to support the animal science teaching and research activities. Block M presently houses the Beef Research Unit but is expected to be relocated to an off-campus location in the near future. As the majority of animal science teaching and research occurs at the main campus farm (and other rural locations) these lands provide an indirect role in teaching and research in the sense that they support the operations of the main campus farm through the production of feed (including silage) and for manure management. (The 41.3 acre/6.7 hectare main campus farm area is considered part of the Core Campus area and Block D2 is not included in this 678 acre/274 hectare land area)

- The proximity of these lands to the Core Campus is convenient but is not critical to teaching and research. If feed, silage and manure management operations that support the main campus farm can be provided through off-campus University lands, these lands can be repurposed for a variety of revenue-generating development opportunities.
The Recommended Land Use Designation Plan

The recommended Land Use Designation Plan is based on the “Recommended Scenario Rationale” from the Land Use Task Force Study (summarized on pages 10 through 12 of this document). See the Land Use Designation Plan on the following page.

Core Campus Lands

Core Campus Lands will continue to provide a direct resource in the University’s mission to provide excellence in teaching and research. Of total University inner-city land holdings of 1,865 acres/755 hectares, 874 acres/354 hectares of land are recommended to be designated as Core Lands. (In comparison the total campus lands for the University of Manitoba = 635 acres/257 hectares; University of British Columbia 420 acres/170 hectares; University of Alberta = 220 acres/89 hectares). Some of the lands identified as Core Campus Lands have an additional designation as Core Campus Lands - Agriculture (Cag as noted on the map on the following page). These are lands that are currently used by the College of Agriculture and that will continue to be important for teaching and research for the College, particularly as other blocks transition to Endowment Lands.

Endowment Lands

Endowment Lands have the potential to provide an indirect role in supporting the University’s core mission by providing a new revenue stream to support a University Endowment Fund, which will generate annuities to be used for strategic projects and initiatives. The preliminary net revenue analysis conducted during the Land Use Task Force process estimated potential contributions ranging from $300 to $900 million depending on the intensity of land development.

Of total University inner-city land holdings of 1865 acres/755 hectares, 991 acres/401 hectares of land are recommended to be designated as Endowment Lands. The Endowment designation allows the University to explore alternatives within a formalized process - to date the process has been ad hoc and problematic. Many lands in the Endowment category will likely continue to be used for their current purpose for many years, but would be available for consideration for other uses as opportunities arise and replacement lands are made available.

The designation of Endowment Lands does not preclude the future use of these lands for Core Campus purposes. Other potential future uses for Endowment Lands may include:

- University related uses: residences, offices, continuing learning
- Mixed-use neighbourhoods
- Research park
- Business park
- Institutional uses
- Commercial uses
- Community uses: recreation, open space

Through the consultation process undertaken as part of the Vision 2057 process, a number of land use issues were identified which will require on-going review as block-specific feasibility studies are undertaken. These include:

- Horticulture: approximately 40 acres/16 hectares of Block B are presently used for horticultural teaching, research and community outreach. If redevelopment of Block B is recommended, a replacement site for horticulture will need to be identified in the near future as a 10-year transition period will be required. On-going discussions with the College of Agriculture and Bioresources will be required to identify the merits of an on-campus versus an off-campus location.
- Innovation Place: Future expansion of Innovation Place may require land either in Core or Endowment Lands areas. The University and Innovation Place should continue to identify the scale and location of future research park expansion.

Those lands identified as Endowment Lands may continue in their current use but would be subject to ‘opportunity-based’ feasibility studies to determine:

- On-going University needs or future needs;
- Opportunities for revenue-generation through urban development of high quality, compact, mixed-use neighbourhoods;
- Financial assessment based on the highest and best uses; and
- Where redevelopment is feasible, strategies for phasing, transition impact costs and servicing requirements and City approvals processes.
The Proposed Land Use Designation Plan.

C = Core Lands
Cag = Core Lands (Agriculture)
E = Endowment Lands
College of Agriculture & Bioresources Land Use Transition Impacts

Based on discussions with the College of Agriculture and Bioresources during the Vision 2057 process, the following list provides a synopsis of a potential sequence of events – primarily related to the operations of the College – that could occur should a transition in land uses occur on Endowment Lands presently used by the College.

- Main campus farm remains on-campus;
- An updated Farm Master Plan is undertaken to identify improvements in facilities and grounds;
- Near-city agriculture lands acquisition (optimal size identified by the College = 16 quarters);
- Beef Research Unit moves to newly acquired land off-campus;
- Land required for dairy (silage/manure) moves to newly acquired land off-campus;
- On-campus composting facility for manure from non-dairy units and other University waste required;
- Field Crop research consolidates on Blocks E, I and J from Blocks A2 and B, subsequent to the relocation of silage/manure operations from Block E and a minimum 5-year transition and irrigation system installation;
- Horticulture research may require relocation to either on-campus or off-campus location. A 10-year transition is required;
- Some existing horticultural specimens may remain as part of park/open spaces and for long-term data;
- Patterson Gardens could remain in-place as a public resource, but responsibility for maintenance would likely be transferred to another University or community entity; and,
- Facilities Management Division’s tree farm would relocate off-campus.

Implementation of these transitions will require financial resources and in some cases may trigger increased operating costs incurred by the College. During the Vision 2057 process the College was clear in its position that these costs cannot be covered within the current College budget and additional resources will need to be identified. An overview of the operational and financial implications of relocation of some of the College’s operations are contained in the College of Agriculture and Bioresources Long Term Land Use Strategy entitled “College of Agriculture and Bioresources Long Term Land Use Strategy” submitted under a separate cover.
Other Conclusions

• Based on case study research of urban agricultural universities across North America - a pattern emerges of increasing conflicts between agricultural uses and urban uses which have led to relocation of the primary agriculture research lands to rural locations.

• While the transference of some of the College’s research and teaching operations to rural locations may create short-term disruption – with appropriate planning, transition periods and access to adequate transportation and land resources – the experience of other agricultural universities demonstrates that this evolution is viable and does not reduce the quality of teaching and research.

• Maintaining a component of agriculture research lands adjacent to the campus provides the College with a competitive advantage over other agriculture universities – but does not require today’s full agricultural land contingent.

• If the University continues to operate the main campus farm and provide a portion of lands for agriculture research on-campus, and can provide additional agriculture lands within a reasonable distance (25 kilometres or less) - the capacity of the College of Agriculture and Bioresources to continue to provide first rate teaching and research will be maintained and possibly enhanced.

• University lands primarily used for support operations for animal science research (feed production/manure handling) can serve a far more valuable role – both economically and strategically – as Endowment Lands. This suggests that the Beef Research Unit be relocated to a rural location; and that feed and manure be transported between the Farm and rural agricultural lands to be acquired by the University. The Beef Research Unit currently requires significant reinvestment and the College would like to see this use relocated to another location outside of the city limits.

• If a significant portion of these lands are transferred to an Endowment use, they have the potential to create a significant permanent revenue stream to fund strategic priorities of the University, address the housing needs of the University community and achieve better integration of the Saskatoon community with the University.

• The gradual development of a portion of the University’s lands as high quality, compact communities is critical to the growth of the City of Saskatoon in accordance with environmentally sustainable policies.
1. UNIVERSITY CONTEXT

1.1 University Lands

The University currently owns approximately 1865 acres/755 hectares of land within the City of Saskatoon. The boundaries of the lands owned by the University of Saskatchewan are roughly 14th Street to the south, Central Avenue and Circle Drive to the east, just north of Garvie Road to the north and the South Saskatchewan River to the west.

Approximately 1120 acres/453 hectares of the total 1865 acres/755 hectares is predominantly utilized by the College of Agriculture and Bioresources for a variety of purposes including teaching and research (this includes Blocks A2, B, C, D2, E, F, G, I, J, K, and M - refer to map on the following page). This represents approximately 60% of the total University of Saskatchewan lands within the City of Saskatoon.

From previous studies it has been concluded that the remaining 40% of the University’s land holdings have the capacity to support long-term growth of the institution and affiliated institutions. Today the campus accommodates approximately 5 million square feet of building area. The 2003 Campus Plan identified the potential for another 3 million square feet of growth to be developed within the main campus lands on blocks D and A. It is therefore unlikely that land beyond these Blocks will be required for expansion of University buildings.
1.2 The University in the City Context

The city’s urban boundary encompasses approximately 44,000 acres/18,000 hectares of land, some of which remains undeveloped (refer to map below). The University of Saskatchewan’s lands constitute about one-twentieth of the total urban lands, but is located at the very core of the City adjacent to the river and the downtown. The University’s lands are bounded on the west by the eastern edge of the South Saskatchewan River and downtown Saskatoon lies just on the other side of the river. Since the University’s founding in 1907, the City has grown around the University’s lands and as Saskatoon continues to grow, these lands have significant value both strategically and financially. The University’s lands are an important component of future sustainable growth for the City of Saskatoon.
The University’s main campus in relation to downtown Saskatoon.
1.3 The University’s Lands Beyond the Core Campus & Saskatoon Urban Area

The University of Saskatchewan has land holdings of approximately 13,300 acres/5,382 hectares across the Province of Saskatchewan, including the main campus lands (see map on opposite page).

These lands are comprised of:

a) Main Saskatoon campus urban lands of 1,865 acres/755 hectares.

b) Approximately 10 sections (6,400 acres/2,590 hectares) used for research purposes either directly by the University of Saskatchewan or by associated institutions.

c) Approximately 8 sections (5,120 acres/2,072 hectares) of farm land outside of Saskatoon that are leased to tenants to grow crops.

Approximately 4,600 acres/1,862 hectares of the lands itemized in b) and cb) above are located within a 25 kilometre radius of the campus and a majority of these lands are within 10 kilometres. Therefore, almost half of the University’s total land holdings (6,465 acres/2,616 hectares) are within, or close to, Saskatoon. This represents a significant land resource and it will play a key role in the University’s future success.

The University is actively pursuing the purchase of additional lands within this near-city area that would increase the availability of agricultural land within a reasonable driving distance from campus to accommodate uses such as the Beef Research Unit which have been determined to be better suited to a non-urban area.

Lands within 25 kilometres to the Core University of Saskatchewan campus: Kernen (1,920 acres/777 hectares) and Goodale (2,366 acres/958 hectares).
The University of Saskatchewan current land resources.
2. LAND USE PLANNING PROCESS

2.1 Introduction

The University of Saskatchewan has studied the role of its significant land holdings since 1999, with the Land Use and Urban Design Study, in 2003 with the Core Area Master Plan and, most recently in 2008, with the Land Use Task Force Study.

The following Section provides a brief overview of the 1999 and 2003 studies, a more detailed summary of the recommendation from the 2008 study, and a summary of the Vision 2057 process. The Land Use Task Force Study’s recommendations directly influenced the recommendations of the Vision 2057 process, therefore requiring a more detailed outline of that study's finding and recommendations.

2.2 Vision 2057 Planning Process (2009)

The Vision 2057 planning process builds upon recent, ongoing land use planning work, in particular the Land Use Task Force Study which immediately preceded the Vision 2057 Study. In many respects, the Vision 2057 Planning Process was a continuation of the recommendations from the Land Use Task Force Study and work of the Land Use Task Force Steering Committee.

Vision 2057 Builds Upon the Land Use Task Force

The Vision 2057 process builds upon the extensive research undertaken as part of the University’s Land Use Task Force which identified a strategy that balances the need to maintain a significant land resource reserved for long-term University purposes - including on-campus agricultural research - while benefiting from potential revenues that could be realized through leasehold development valued at between $300 - $900 million to fund a permanent University Endowment.

Vision 2057 Process

The Vision 2057 process has been directed by a Steering Committee with representation from various University academic and administrative units as well as external members representing the City of Saskatoon, the Meewasin Valley Authority, the Province of Saskatchewan and Innovation Place.

The work of the Vision 2057 Steering Committee was assisted by consultants in the areas of land use planning (Brook McIlroy Inc.), transportation (Marshall Macklin Monaghan) and municipal services (Genivar).

A key focus of the Vision 2057 process was to engage key University and external stakeholders in a consultation process as a continuation of the in-depth University consultation process undertaken as part of the Land Use Task Force. The deliberations of the Steering Committee facilitated strategic input by key stakeholders represented in the composition of the Committee membership.
Beyond the Committee process, consultations focused on a review of the proposed land use strategy and identified implications and impacts of a transition in land uses. This consultation process included:

- **College of Agriculture and Bioresources**: On-going meetings were held throughout the Vision 2057 process with College representatives including a College-wide workshop. In-depth meetings were held to formulate and review a College Long-Term Land Strategy.

- **City of Saskatoon**: University briefing session followed by a full-day University/City workshop to identify implications of development of University Endowment lands. The City’s Future Growth Strategy will be finalized by 2011; The City is planning for growth from 200,000 at present to 400,000 in 50 to 75 years. Once the University’s Land Use Designation Plan is adopted, a more in-depth collaboration with the City will be required.

- **Executive Committee of Saskatoon City Council**: A Vision 2057 briefing presentation by the University (May 11, 2009).

- **A University/Community Open House was held on May 26, 2009, which included invitation to and representation by crop and livestock industry organizations.**
2.3 Land Use Task Force Study (2008)

The University of Saskatchewan created a Land Use Task Force to review its land use decision-making process, and identify future scenarios for the use of the University’s land over the next 50 years. The Task Force members included senior representatives from a variety of academic units and administration and were assisted by consultants in the areas of land use planning and land development financial analysis.

Key tasks included: research on the experience and practices of other North American Universities; interviews with a variety of University of Saskatchewan and City stakeholders; workshops with the College’s of Agriculture and Bioresources, Kinesiology, and Arts and Science; the creation and testing of 50 year land use scenarios; financial analysis of the revenue potential from land development of a portion of the University’s holdings; and, a recommended methodology for reviewing and making land use decisions within the context of the University community. The Task Force recommendations include the adoption of a Land Use Decision Framework that corresponds with the University’s existing Major Project Planning process and a 50-year land use vision to go forward to a review and approvals process using the proposed framework.

For the Land Use Task Force Study, five main tasks were completed, this included:

1. **An update of the University’s land use inventory**
   Information was compiled listing and describing uses of the University’s land, particularly with respect to agricultural research and teaching lands surrounding the main campus. The College of Agriculture and Bioresources provided significant insight into their unique land use and operations.

2. **Consultation with internal and external stakeholders**
   Meetings with representatives of many internal academic and functional divisions, as well as a number of external stakeholders.
   Internal: Colleges of Agriculture and Bioresources; Kinesiology; Arts and Science; and, Engineering.
   Integrated Planning Office; Office Consumer Services (Residences); and Corporate Administration.
   External: City of Saskatoon Planning; City of Saskatoon Lands Branch; Innovation Place; Saskatchewan Arts Board; Meewasin Valley Authority; and The Downtown Partnership; Broadway and Riversdale Business Improvement Districts (BID).

3. **A review of best practices at universities facing similar issues**
   Case study research involving fifteen North American universities were conducted as part of the Task Force Study. Topics discussed with these universities included: evolution in agricultural land uses (urban and rural experiences); land use decision-making frameworks; university land development precedents; sustainability of agricultural research and teaching lands in an urban context; impacts on agricultural department’s operations facing similar land use transition issues; and, city-university interface and integration.

   A series of interviews were completed with educators and administrators at institutions with agricultural land holdings from approximately ten institutions across North America. The interviewees provided essential insights into the costs, benefits, opportunities and impacts of maintaining and/or relocating agricultural teaching and research land.

   Several universities that have created land trust corporations to manage lands for the purposes of creating a university endowment were interviewed as a part of this process. Precedents of university development including mixed-use communities on-campus and campus extensions into inner-cities, were reviewed.
4. **Identification of future land uses (over 50 years) and preliminary financial analysis**

At the core of any discussion on the future of the University’s lands is to weigh the value of keeping these lands in the current use versus developing them as part of the University and urban community. Given the historical use of the lands and their role as a key resource to the College of Agriculture and Bioresources - this is clearly a sensitive issue that must be deliberated in an open and rational manner. This process recognized that a sudden removal or relocation of the College’s teaching and research lands would be highly disruptive to current research and demoralizing to the College, therefore a long-term approach is necessary. The advantage of the 50-year horizon established by the Task Force is that it allows for a degree of predictability and a rational planning context that takes into consideration transition times as land uses evolve.

5. **Recommendation of a new decision making framework**

The proposed decision framework takes into account the best practices review, a study of the University of Saskatchewan Act, 1995, existing decision making and administrative processes, and the input of stakeholders.

The Land Use Task Force Study recommended the adoption of a transparent process of review and consultation – the Land Use Decision Process contained in the Study report as a means to consider the long-range land use plan. This process should be administered by the Integrated Planning Office (IPO) reporting to the Land and Facilities Committee and should mirror the current Major Project Planning Process in a seamless way.

2.3.1 **Recommended Scenario Rationale**

The Land Use Task Force Study weighed the opportunity costs of using its significant land endowment for continued agriculture use versus the benefits that can be realized from appropriate forms of revenue-generating urban development. The benefits of high-quality, sustainable urban development – if carefully controlled by the University – are both financial and strategic. A clear benefit is that the University’s urban lands can be positioned to provide a permanent financial endowment through renewable land leases. As part of research for the Land Use Task Force Study, land development scenarios were tested through financial modeling. The results demonstrated significant economic returns to the University. But the benefits extend beyond a new source of revenue for the University. The future use of these lands is of strategic importance to the University, the City and the Province.

Today, thirty percent of the core area of Saskatoon – the lands in and around the downtown – are owned by the University. Twenty-one percent of this core city area is presently used for agricultural purposes by the University. Given their proximity to the downtown and the University and their riverfront setting – these lands constitute the most valuable undeveloped urban real estate in Saskatchewan.

A number of future land use scenarios based on a 50 year horizon were developed. Land use options ranged from status quo to complete relocation of the College of Agriculture and Bioresources users, with several options in-between. These options were presented to the Task Force to review the strengths and weaknesses of each scenario. The Task Force recommended a balanced approach (See the recommended scenario on the following page) be used as a ‘working –scenario’ to be taken forward through the Vision 2057 process as the basis for in-depth consultations with the University community and the City of Saskatoon.

The recommended scenario achieves a balance by permitting the University to leverage the significant economic and strategic value of its central city lands through appropriate development over time while maintaining a significant, agricultural land base contiguous to the campus for teaching, research and outreach. The
The recommended scenario was selected as a result of weighing the potential impacts of transference of some College of Agriculture land uses to non-urban locations against the significant economic value, and strategic value of urban development for both the University and the City as a whole.

The recommended scenario supports continued use of the 40-acre/16-hectare main campus farm (Block D2) for animal research and 300 acres/121 hectares of the most centrally located agricultural lands primarily for plant and crop science research. These parcels are bounded by Preston Avenue, College Drive, Circle Drive and the CP railway. Lands that are presently used for feed production and manure management to support the operations of the main campus farm would transition over time, on an opportunity basis, and be repurposed for a variety of urban development or University-related uses. Feed and manure-handling operations would be provided on lands outside of the city but within reasonable travelling distance. Additional lands for agricultural research would therefore be required both for this purpose and for the relocation of the Beef Research Unit.

The 340-acre/138-hectare area recommended for agricultural use is the most appropriate area to remain as agricultural land as it is the most contiguous with the campus - permitting easy access for teaching and research. In addition, as a large open space bounded by major roads and the railway it is naturally separate from the surrounding city, and therefore more conducive for a discrete use. Conversely the lands outside of this core area, identified for transition to future urban development, are naturally contiguous with existing neighbourhoods, compatible land uses and amenities such as the River. They offer opportunity for a greater synthesis between the campus, the downtown and adjacent neighbourhoods – and are of the highest economic and strategic value.

The 340-acre/138-hectare core agricultural land area is also highly visible and has a traditional role as a central city open space, while also acting as a foreground to the University. These lands can continue to provide a strong symbolic link to the College and serve as a powerful element in the identity of the University and its presence in Saskatoon.

The recommended scenario’s rationale for the maintenance of certain lands and the relocation of specific agriculture land uses is also based on the Study’s findings that the operations associated with maintaining animals on-site tend to have the highest opportunity costs. Lands accommodating animals are both highly land consumptive and require isolation from surrounding land uses. Odours from areas where animal herds are kept lead to land use conflicts in a developing urban setting, but are magnified when large land areas are used for manure handling. Manure handling and feed production are operations that are highly land consumptive yet can be readily provided off-site. While this may require additional investment in transportation and may reduce the convenience of feed production and manure handling close to the campus – these costs are far outweighed by the advantage of using these inner-city lands for other revenue-generating purposes.

The consolidation of agriculture uses in the central 340-acre/138-hectare parcel (Blocks D2, E, I and J) therefore implies a focus on plant science uses for urban research and relocation of animal science support areas such as feed production and manure handling to the University’s rural lands. This scenario allows for the continued use of the main campus farm as a base for on-campus animals. Block E’s current use for feed production and manure handling would transition to plant science research which would include the relocation of some existing plant science activities on Blocks A2 and B to Block E.
2.3.2 The 50-Year Vision

The transition from agriculture use to endowment purposes will occur over decades. The phased implementation of the 50-year vision will allow for an appropriate planning timeframe for the College of Agriculture and Bioresources thereby avoiding disruption in operations.

In looking at future scenarios, the Task Force Study considered development of University lands as vibrant, compact, mixed-use districts recognizing the potential to create a sustainable pattern of growth for Saskatoon and to vastly improve the integration of the University with the surrounding communities and the downtown.

A number of development scenarios were created by studying the market for land development in Saskatoon, present land uses, their urban context, identification of technical, aesthetic and economic opportunities and constraints, and professional insight on appropriate forms of sustainable development.

2.3.3 Financial Analysis

The University’s lands were evaluated parcel-by-parcel. Fifty year scenarios for each parcel were formulated including visioning future redevelopment as integrated communities. Space analysis was conducted to estimate density and residential/commercial yield. The data was then used as an input to a preliminary pro forma analysis to estimate net financial return. The results of this analysis illustrate the enormous potential of these lands to accommodate between 40,000 and 60,000 units of housing developed over time, as well as significant commercial, recreational and institutional uses.

As a means of understanding the approximate order-of-magnitude value of the University’s undeveloped lands, the working scenario was used as a test case. The scenario assumes a phased build out of 780 acres/216 hectares of land over an approximate 70 year period on a leasehold basis – predominately for residential purposes with about 5% of the total density for commercial purposes. (The calculations do not include revenue streams from commercial uses which range between 2-3 million square feet, nor do they include Preston Crossing – these revenues would be in addition to the figures presented below).

The phasing of development is based an average annual absorption rates for the City of Saskatoon with a 20% market share attributed to the University lands. Leases are assumed to be prepaid - hence the years spanning 2042 to 2048 is the approximate date that the first cycle of 99 year land leases would be paid out. Lease renewals would occur after this first cycle – perhaps on a 30 year basis – and become a source of additional revenue renewal. (The calculations do not include revenue streams from lease renewals – these would be in addition to the figures presented below).

The Endowment is created from net revenues generated by land-leases – the costs of administering and servicing lands are therefore subtracted from the gross lease income. The Endowment is assumed to earn a 7% average annual return (this figure is somewhat conservative if compared to the 20-year performance of University of British Columbia’s endowment with an average annual return of 9%). Four percent of the Endowment is assumed to be spent annually by the University on strategic (non-operating) initiatives.
Three scenarios were tested:

**Low Density**

A low-density scenario was based on a 0.5 Floor Space Index (FSI). This is typical of suburban residential development densities in Saskatoon and similar to the University of Guelph’s Village by the Arboretum. Given its downtown proximity, this form of urban growth is neither recommended nor viable as a land development pattern for the University’s lands.

At year 2042 the value of the Endowment would be $161 million and the sum of annuities for annual University expenditures would total $140 million. (Total = $301 million).

**Medium Density**

A medium-density scenario was based on a 1.2 Floor Space Index (FSI). This is typical of mixed inner city residential developments similar to those being developed at University of British Columbia. A range of housing types including single-family homes, townhomes, apartments and point towers are combined in a high quality master planned community.

At year 2048 the value of the Endowment would be $339 million and the sum of annuities for annual University expenditures would total $233 million. (Total = $572 million).

**High Density**

A high-density scenario was based on a 1.8 Floor Space Index (FSI). This is also typical of mixed inner city residential developments, and similar to those being developed at Simon Fraser which does not include single-family homes. A range of housing types including townhomes, apartments and point towers are combined in a high quality master planned community.

At year 2048 the value of the Endowment would be $535 million and the sum of annuities for annual University expenditures would total $341 million (Total = $876 million).

### 2.3.4 Summary of Key Findings & Recommendations

With regards to the use of the University lands, the Land Use Task Force Study recommended that the 50-year land use strategy be based on the following:

- Establish a University land use designation system that would identify at least 340 acres/138 hectares of agriculture research lands as Core Lands adjacent to the campus while placing the remaining 570 acres/231 hectares of lands presently used by the College of Agriculture and Bioresources (Blocks A2, B, C, F, M; but excluding the approximately 30 acres/12 hectares used by other departments) in the Endowment Lands category. Those lands identified as Endowment Lands may continue to be used in their current use but would be subject to ‘opportunity-based’ feasibility studies on a block basis to determine: the highest and best uses; opportunities for revenue-generation through urban development as high quality, compact, mixed-use neighbourhoods; on-going University needs or future needs; transition phasing; transition impact costs and required servicing requirements and City approvals processes.

- Acquire additional rural lands for agricultural research in a near-city location. (The College of Agriculture and Bioresources has identified land acquisition needs which are contained in the College’s report submitted under separate cover).

- Where feasible, maintain long-term University control of developed Endowment Lands through long-term land-leases.

- Dedicate proceeds from land development to a permanent Endowment Fund generating annual annuities to support University priority (non-operating) initiatives.

- Establish a University Endowment Lands Trust Corporation reporting to the Board of Governors to manage and administer land development of the University’s Endowment Lands.
2.4 Core Area Master Plan (2003)

The Core Area Master Plan was prepared to support the strategic goals of the University. The Plan established a physical framework for the growth of new areas and enhancement of existing areas within the University’s Core Campus area. The Plan was based on an evaluation of space and growth needs, and strategic priorities.

The 2003 Campus Plan identified the potential for long-term growth of another 3 million square feet/279,000 square metres of building area that could be comfortably accommodated within the developed Core Campus area. Future University growth contained within the developed area (referred to as the Core Campus and College Quarter areas) as opposed to expansion beyond these areas is desirable as a means of maintaining reasonable walking distances between campus facilities.

This 3 million square feet/279,000 square metre potential growth would represent a 60% increase in building area, an FSI of 0.38, and would translate to a potential student enrollment of 25,900 (compared to the 2008-09 enrolment of 19,200).

This is a conservative estimate that takes into account the holding of key sites for parking structures, generous open space areas and an average building height of four floors. In some instances, buildings higher than four floors can be accommodated on-campus, while in more sensitive areas (adjacent to the River, Bowl, College Drive and Campus Drive) more modest building scale is desirable.

2.5 Land Use & Urban Design Study (1999)

The study was commissioned by the Board of Governors to review the current use of the University’s inner-city land holdings to evaluate their potential to generate revenue and to develop a framework to guide their future use. In the initial stages of the study, the consultant team met with stakeholders to collect and analyze all relevant information.

Three land use options were developed and presented through an Advisory Committee meeting and a public open house. Further refinements were made to the land use options and a new development scenario was prepared, which was approved in principle by the Board of Governors as the preferred option.

The final report identified three categories of lands:
- Lands critical to the present academic, research, extension and community service function of the University;
- Lands to be protected for long-term growth; and
- Lands which may be potentially leased or sold for development.

Following this, development options for these lands were created and their revenue generating potential was estimated. This study also provided general urban design principles and implementation recommendations to guide future development to ensure compatibility with the core campus and surrounding neighborhoods.

A key result of this study was the rezoning of the Preston Crossing lands and the subsequent leasing of these lands to a development partner. Preston Crossing provides revenues to the University which supports significant University undergraduate scholarships.
3. PROPOSED LAND USE DESIGNATIONS

3.1 Introduction

The Proposed Land Use Designation Plan illustrates an ‘ultimate scenario’, or how land uses might look in a 50-100 year timeframe.

The Plan shows a total of 874 acres/354 hectares retained as Core Campus Lands that will continue to be used for teaching and research by the College of Agriculture and Bioresources and others. Of these lands, approximately 340 acres/138 hectares will be designated as Core Campus Lands with an agricultural focus. The remainder of the lands not identified as Core Campus Lands, will be designated Endowment Lands.

Rationale for Recommended Land Use Designation

The proposed Land Use designations are based on the following findings:

- If the University continues to operate the main campus farm and provide a portion of lands for agriculture research on-campus, and can provide additional contiguous agriculture lands within a reasonable distance (25 kilometres or less) - the capacity of the College of Agriculture and Bioresources to continue to provide first rate teaching and research will be maintained and possibly enhanced.

- University lands primarily used for support operations for animal science research (feed production/manure handling) can serve a far more valuable role – both economically and strategically – as Endowment Lands. This suggests that the Beef Research Unit be relocated to a rural location; and that feed and manure be transported between the main campus farm and rural agricultural lands to be acquired by the University. The Beef Research Unit currently requires significant reinvestment and the College would like to see this use relocated to another location outside of the city limits.

- If a significant portion of these lands are transferred to an Endowment use, they have the potential to create a significant permanent revenue stream to fund strategic priorities of the University, address the housing needs of the University community and achieve better integration of the Saskatoon community with the University.

- The gradual development of a portion of the University’s lands as high quality, compact communities is critical to the growth of the City of Saskatoon in accordance with environmentally sustainable policies.
3.2 The Land Use Designation Plan

3.2.1 Description of Designations

The recommended Land Use Designation Plan assumes that the College of Agriculture and Bioresources will continue to locate some of its operations in the short to medium time frame on or close to the Core Campus, while some College of Agriculture and Bioresources uses would relocate outside of these lands. The Plan assumes that continuation of College of Agriculture and Bioresources uses are balanced with the University’s objective to derive revenue from its land endowment, to create new mixed-use neighbourhoods that better integrate the University into the fabric of the City and in so doing demonstrate leadership in shaping a sustainable form of urban development.

The recommended plan:

- Maintains the most critical and intensively-used plant and crop research plots;
- Maintains use of the main campus farm (Block D2) as a centre for animal research, with improvements to facilities and grounds;
- Assumes that most of the ‘support’ lands primarily used for feed/silage production and manure handling required by the Department of Animal and Poultry Science are relocated to off-site locations;
- Shifts current uses on Block A2 to Block E, with a minimum 5-year transition period once the feed and manure-handling operations have been relocated to a new site;
- Designate as “Endowment Lands”, Blocks A2, B, C, F, K, L, M, N, and O and investigate potential development opportunities on an on-going basis. Current land uses may remain operational in the interim;
- Assume intensification of the Core Campus (Block D), College Quarter (Block A1), Block G and Block H (Innovation Place) as per the 2003 Core Area Master Plan. From the 2003 Plan, additions and infill would provide at least 3 million square feet of new University space (at an average building height of 4 storeys), in addition to the existing 5 million square feet; and
- Wherever possible, redevelopment should be based on land-lease but especially for lands that may have long-term strategic value for University-related uses that may be unforeseen at this time.
3.2.2 Core Lands

Core Lands will continue to provide a direct resource in the University’s mission to provide excellence in teaching and research. Of total University inner-city land holdings of 1865 acres/755 hectares, 874 acres/354 hectares of land are recommended to be designated as Core Lands. (In comparison, the total campus lands for the University of Manitoba = 635 acres/257 hectares; University of British Columbia 420 acres/170 hectares; University of Alberta = 220 acres/89 hectares). Some of the lands identified as Core Lands have an additional designation as Core Lands - Agriculture (Cag as noted on the map on the following page). These are lands that are currently used by the College of Agriculture and Bioresources and that will continue to be important for teaching and research for the College, particularly as other blocks transition to Endowment Lands.

3.2.3 Endowment Lands

Endowment Lands have the potential to provide an indirect role in supporting the University’s core mission by providing a new revenue stream to support a University Endowment Fund, which will generate annuities to be used for strategic projects and initiatives. The preliminary net revenue analysis conducted during the Land Use Task Force process estimated potential contributions ranging from $300 to $900 million depending on the intensity of land development.

Of total University inner-city land holdings of 1865 acres/755 hectares, 991 acres/401 hectares of land are recommended to be designated as Endowment Lands. The Endowment designation allows the University to explore alternatives within a formalized process - to date the process has been ad hoc and has been problematic. Many lands in the Endowment category will likely continue to be used for their current purpose for many years, but would be available for consideration for other uses as opportunities arise and replacement lands are made available.

The designation of Endowment Lands does not preclude the future use of these lands for Core Campus purposes. Other potential future uses for Endowment Lands may include:

- University related uses: residences, offices, continuing learning
- Mixed-use Neighbourhoods
- Research Park
- Business Park
- Institutional uses
- Commercial Uses
- Recreation, open space

Those lands identified as Endowment Lands may continue to be used in their current use but would be subject to ‘opportunity-based’ feasibility studies to determine:

- On-going University needs or future needs;
- Opportunities for revenue-generation through urban development of high quality, compact, mixed-use neighbourhoods;
- Financial assessment based on the highest and best uses; and
- Where redevelopment is feasible, strategies for phasing; transition impact costs and servicing requirements and City approvals processes.

See the Proposed Land Use Designation Plan on page 20 for the location of Core and Endowment Lands.
3.3 The Land Use Designation Plan Rationale

- The Land Use Designation Plan achieves a balance by permitting the University to leverage the significant economic and strategic value of its central city lands through appropriate development over time while maintaining a significant, highly visible agricultural land base contiguous to the campus for teaching, research and outreach. This Plan is recommended as a result of weighing the potential impacts of transference of some College of Agriculture and Bioresources land uses to non-urban locations against the significant economic value and strategic value of urban development for both the University and the City as a whole.

- The Land Use Designation Plan supports the continued use of 340 acres/138 hectares of the most centrally located land (including Block D2 - the main campus farm) for agriculture use. The agriculture land parcels are bounded by Preston Avenue, College Drive, Circle Drive and the CP railway. This is the most appropriate area to remain as agricultural land as it is the most contiguous with the campus - permitting easy access for teaching and research. In addition, as a large open space bounded by major roads and the railway it is naturally separate from the surrounding city, and therefore more conducive for a discrete use such as research fields. Conversely the lands outside of this core area, identified for transition to future urban development, are naturally contiguous with existing neighbourhoods, compatible land uses and amenities such as the River. They offer opportunity for a greater synthesis between the campus, the downtown and adjacent neighbourhoods – and are of the highest economic and strategic value.

- The 340-acre/138-hectare core agricultural land area is also highly visible and has a traditional role as a central city open space – while also acting as a foreground to the University. These lands can continue to provide a strong symbolic link to the College and serve as a powerful element in the identity of the University and its presence in Saskatoon.

- The Land Use Designation Plan’s rationale for the maintenance of certain lands and the relocation of specific agriculture land uses is also based on previous study findings that the operations associated with maintaining animals on-site tend to have the highest opportunity costs. Lands accommodating animals are both highly land consumptive and require isolation from surrounding land uses. Odours from areas where animal herds are kept lead to land use conflicts in a developing inner city setting, but are magnified when large land areas are used for manure handling. Manure handling and feed production are operations that are highly land consumptive yet could be easily provided off-site. While this may require additional investment in transportation and may impact today’s convenience of feed production and manure handling close to the campus – we believe these costs are far outweighed by the advantage of using this inner-city land for other purposes.

- The consolidation of agriculture uses in the central 340-acre/138-hectare parcel (Blocks D2, E, I and J) therefore implies a focus on plant and crop science uses for field research and relocation of animal science support uses such as feed production and manure handling to University-owned rural lands. This scenario supports the continued use of the main campus farm as a base for on-campus animals. Block E’s current use for feed production and manure handling would transition to plant science research which would include the relocation of some existing plant science activities on Blocks A2 and B to Block E.

- The transition from agriculture use to endowment purposes will occur over decades. The phased implementation of this 50-year vision will allow for an appropriate planning time frame for the College thereby avoiding disruption in operations.
C = Core Lands
Cag = Core Lands (Agriculture)
E = Endowment Lands

The Proposed Land Use Designation Plan.

Brook McIlroy Inc.
• Through the consultation process undertaken as part of the Vision 2057 process, a number of land use issues were identified which will require on-going review as block-specific feasibility studies are undertaken. These include:
  - Horticulture: approximately 40 acres/16 hectares of Block B are presently used for horticultural teaching, research and community outreach. If redevelopment of Block B is recommended a replacement site for Horticulture will need to be identified in the near future as a 10-year transition period may be required. On-going discussions with the College of Agriculture and Bioresources will be required to identify the merits of an on-campus versus an off-campus location.
  - Innovation Place: Future expansion of Innovation Place may require land either in Core or Endowment Lands areas. The University and Innovation Place should continue to identify the scale and location of future research park expansion.

3.4 College of Agriculture & Bioresources
Land Use Transition Impacts

Based on discussions with the College of Agriculture and Bioresources during the Vision 2057 process, the following list provides a synopsis of a potential sequence of events – primarily related to the operations of the College – that could occur should a transition in land uses occur on Endowment Lands presently used by the College.

• Main campus farm remains on campus;
• An updated Farm Master Plan is undertaken to identify improvements in facilities and grounds;
• Near-city agriculture lands acquisition (optimal size identified by the College = 16 quarters);
• Beef Research Unit moves to newly acquired land off-campus;
• Land required for dairy (silage/manure) moves to newly acquired land off-campus;
• On-campus composting facility for manure from non-dairy units and other University waste required;
• Field Crop research consolidates on Blocks E, I and J from Blocks A2 and B, subsequent to the relocation of silage/manure operations from Block E and a minimum 5-year transition and irrigation system installation;
• Horticulture research may require relocation to either on-campus or off-campus location. A 10-year transition may be required;
• Some existing horticultural specimens may remain as part of park/open spaces and for long-term data;
• Patterson Gardens could remain in-place as a public resource, but responsibility for maintenance would likely be transferred to another University or community entity; and,
• Facilities Management Division’s Tree Farm would relocate off-campus.
Implementation of these transitions will require financial resources and in some cases may trigger increased operating costs incurred by the College of Agriculture and Bioresources. During the Vision 2057 process the College was clear in its position that these costs cannot be covered within the current College budget and additional resources will need to be identified. An overview of the operational and financial implications of relocation of some of the College’s operations are contained in the College of Agriculture and Bioresources Long Term Land Use Strategy entitled “College of Agriculture and Bioresources Long-Term Land Use Strategy” submitted under a separate cover.